# Department of Education Office of Civil Rights - Resolution Agreement Compliance Scorecard

Academic Year 2022-2023 As of: 10/24/2022

## Introduction

### Scope:

This compliance review was conducted to validate university compliance with requirements of the resolution agreement between the U.S. Department of Education Office of Civil Rights (OCR) and Michigan State University (the University). The objectives of this review were:

* To determine if the agreed upon obligations are substantially completed;
* To determine if the completed obligations comply with settlement agreement requirements;
* To determine if output of completed obligations are supported by appropriate documentation.

In order to accomplish our objectives, we:

* Categorized all obligations into actionable steps. The document contained a total of 41 actionable steps that were incorporated into our review.
* Identified individuals responsible for ensuring that obligations were being met.
* Interviewed responsible parties to determine the status of the obligation.
* Reviewed supporting documentation to validate completion of obligations in accordance with agreement requirements.

### Conclusions:

Based on our review of the resolution agreement and actions taken towards the obligations within we confirmed that the obligations for the period 9/21/2022 – 10/24/2022 were met and supported by comprehensive and appropriate supporting documentation. Our review did not identify any material inconsistencies with resolution agreement requirements. For this period we determined 40 items are implemented, 0 items are submitted, 1 item is in progress and 0 have not started. An updated progress measurement of the obligations by category is provided below:

### MSU Status Key\*\*:

| **Status** | **Definition** |
| --- | --- |
| Implemented | Action completed, no additional reporting requirements unless designated as ongoing requirement in comments. For ongoing requirements, policy/procedure implemented to monitor future compliance. |
| Submitted | Initial required reporting obligation provided to government agency. |
| In Progress | Action initiated, development/improvement continues. |
| Not Started | Action not initiated but not yet due (or action is contingent). |

## Resolution Agreement Compliance Status

### Title IX Structure

To ensure that the University's Office of Civil Rights and Title IX Education and Compliance has the independent authority to address and respond appropriately to reports of sex discrimination and to avoid potential conflicts of interest MSU will amend its Title IX investigation structure.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **I.A** | The University will require any individual employed in the Title IX Office who previously provided legal representation on Title IX matters to recuse themselves from Title IX matters on which they previously provided legal advice or exercised oversight over and Title IX matters that involve one or more of the same parties as a matter on which they previously provided legal advice or exercised oversight over.  *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020* | Implemented | *No current employee of MSU's Title IX Office previously provided legal representation to MSU on Title IX matters.* |
| **I.B.1** | The University will continue to ensure none of its Title IX coordinators, Office of Institutional Equity (OIE) investigators, persons making decisions regarding whether a Title IX or University policy violation occurred, or any medical or scientific expert the University calls upon for an independent opinion in the course of a Title IX investigation, have a conflict of interest or bias for or against complainants or respondents. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy, effective August 14, 2020.* |
| **I.B.2** | The University will revise its existing conflict of interest policy to include medical and scientific expert witnesses. Policy must state that an actual or apparent conflict of interest shall prohibit service as an expert absent a waiver by all parties.  *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy, effective August 14, 2020.* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **I.C** | The University will review the oversight structure of the Title IX Office and make any necessary changes to ensure authority and independence is proper. The University must ensure that the Title IX Office continues to report directly to the President; oversees all of the University's Title IX investigations and coordinates Title IX compliance; and is free from undue influence or pressure from other individuals or units within the University. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020* | Implemented | *The Office for Civil Rights and Title IX Education and Compliance currently reports directly to the President. This office is responsible for leadership of MSU's civil rights compliance and oversees Title IX policies and grievance procedures.* |
| **I.D.1** | The University will commission an independent third-party consultant for three years to review the Title IX grievance process. This review will include the University's completed Title IX Investigations to ensure University policies were followed and that policies are compliant with legal standards. | Implemented | *Ongoing requirement. The oversight committee has engaged a consultant for a three year period and will continue to monitor for compliance.* |
| **I.D.2** | The consultant will submit a written report of the results of its review and any recommendations to the University bi-annually. The University will submit each consultant’s report, as well as a proposed action plan to respond to the consultant’s report, to OCR for its review and approval. *Reporting Deadline: submission to OCR 60 days following receipt of report and implementation of action plan 14 days following OCR approval.* | Implemented | *Ongoing requirements. Consultant reports due:* 1/31/2020 - *Received.* 6/30/2020 - *Received.* 1/31/2021 - *Received.* 6/30/2021 - *Received.* 1/31/2022 - *Received*. 6/30/2022 - *Received 7/18/2022*.  *MSU submission of report and response to OCR due:* 3/31/2020 - *Submitted.* 8/30/2020 - *Submitted.* 3/31/2021 - *Submitted.* 8/30/2021 - *Submitted.* 3/31/2022 - *Submitted*. 8/30/2022 (extended to 9/16/2022) - Submitted. |
| **I.D.3** | The University will provide all completed Title IX complaint files to OCR for three academic years. *Reporting deadline: October 17, 2022 (60 days following close of academic year).* | Implemented | *Ongoing requirement.* 2019-2020 - *Submitted.* 2020-2021 - *Submitted.* 2021-2022 - *Submitted*. |

### Title IX Procedures

To ensure University students and employees know the University's non-discrimination policy and how to report incidents of sex discrimination, MSU will draft changes to its Title IX procedures. To ensure that Title IX investigations, and if appropriate, violation findings are recorded in a manner to ensure institutional knowledge of the same, MSU will draft procedures governing personnel file maintenance.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **II.A.1** | The University will continue to ensure that its notice of nondiscrimination and anti-harassment statement are posted prominently on its website and contain current information. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *A link to the notice of nondiscrimination and anti-harassment statement is available on the University homepage.* |
| **II.A.2** | The University will post the notice of nondiscrimination and anti-harassment statement in the places that Title IX regulation requires postings of ongoing notice. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *The notice was posted on numerous University websites which provide information to students, parents, employees, unions, and applicants for admission and employment.* |
| **II.A.3** | The University will post the notice of nondiscrimination and anti-harassment statement in the places that the Departments of Student Affairs and Athletics regularly post physical notices to students and student athletes. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *The notice was physically posted in the Student Services building as well as the athletic training rooms and athletic facility common areas.* |
| **II.A.4** | The University will email the campus community—including students, employees, and youth program participants—a copy of, or a one-click link to, this Agreement, the notice of nondiscrimination, and the anti-harassment statement. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *An email with this information was sent to students and employees on 1/3/2020. Youth program leaders were also notified by email and the information is available on the youth program website.* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **II.B** | The President and Chair of the Board of Trustees (BOT) shall receive a report identifying all open and recently resolved Title IX complaints and final investigative reports/written determinations filed against employees each semester.  *Reporting Deadline: 30 days after close of each semester* | Implemented | *Ongoing requirement. Requirement reflected in the updated RVSM policy (approved by OCR).*   Fall 2019 - *Submitted.* Spring 2020 - *Submitted.* Summer 2020 - *Submitted.* Fall 2020 - *Submitted.* Spring 2021 - *Submitted.* Summer 2021 - *Submitted.* Fall 2021 - *Submitted*. Spring 2022 - *Submitted.* Summer 2022 - *Submitted*. |
| **II.C** | The University will issue a statement, distributed to all of its employees, that the University will promptly forward all Title IX reports received by responsible employees of which the University is aware to the Title IX Office. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *This statement was distributed on 1/3/2020.* |
| **II.D** | The University will document the actions it takes in response to Title IX complaints at each stage of the investigation and grievance process and will clearly identify all actions taken in response to Title IX complaints.  *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy, effective August 14, 2020.* |
| **II.E.1** | The University will revise its Title IX procedure to prohibit the use of scientific expert witnesses who have an actual or apparent bias or conflict of interest. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy, effective August 14, 2020.* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **II.E.2** | The University will amend its procedures as necessary to ensure that all parties have an equal opportunity to provide expert witnesses, that expert witnesses are identified as such in any final written report, and that the final report reflects that the expert did not have a conflict of interest. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy, effective August 14, 2020.* |
| **II.F** | The University will continue to provide parties the same preliminary investigative report and same final investigative report or final determination. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy, effective August 14, 2020.* |
| **II.G** | The University will provide a process for determining when it must reopen a previously completed Title IX matter due to newly discovered evidence. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy, effective August 14, 2020.* |
| **II.H.1** | The University will designate “responsible employees” in accordance with the law and regulations in effect as of the time of the designation and require that such employees report possible sex discrimination of which they are notified to the Title IX Office. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *Requirement reflected in the revised RVSM and Title IX Policy and University Reporting Protocols, effective August 14, 2020* |
| **II.H.2** | The University will maintain and publish to persons designated as responsible employees its policies and procedures to define the conduct that employees must report to the Title IX Office, describe how the University will determine if the policy on reporting has been violated, describe the consequences for violating the policy, and how the University will implement and document those consequences. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval.* | Implemented | *A new Reporting Protocol: Relationship Violence and Sexual Misconduct became effective August 14, 2020 and reflects these requirements.* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **II.I.1** | The University will post a statement on the home page of its website, on its Title IX web page, and in its Notice of Nondiscrimination that Title IX regulation prohibits retaliation against reporters of sex discrimination, including reports of sex discrimination against administrators and other employees. The statement will include assurance that the University will independently investigate alleged retaliation for participation in the Title IX process. *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020* | Implemented | *This statement was posted on 1/3/2020.* |
| **II.I.2** | The University will distribute the above statement regarding retaliation to all employees and students at the beginning of each academic year. *Reporting Deadline: September 24, 2021* | Implemented | *Ongoing requirement. 2019-2020: Distributed.  2020-2021: Distributed. 2021-2022: Distributed.* |
| **II.J.1** | The University will require the existence of all final Title IX reports and determinations against staff, faculty, and administrators to be noted in the respondent's personnel file, consistent with state and local laws, University policies, and applicable collective bargaining agreements. The notation should include a summary of the nature of the allegation, whether a finding was made, and any sanctions imposed.  *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *A policy governing the maintenance of personnel files was created, submitted to OCR, and posted on the Human Resources website.* |
| **II.J.2** | The University will notify its employees of the consequences of non-compliance with this requirement.  *Reporting Deadline: January 6, 2020 and adoption/dissemination 45 days after OCR approval* | Implemented | *The consequences of non-compliance are outlined in the personnel file policy, submitted to OCR. OARC will monitor for compliance with policy.* |

### Employee Sanctions

To address any impact determined to exist and provide appropriate remedies to restore access to University programs and activities.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **III.A.1** | The University will review the actions of those current and former employees who had notice, or were reported to have received notice, of complaints or concerns of sex discrimination committed by either Nassar or Strampel and failed to take appropriate action. If the University’s review determines that an individual did receive a complaint of sex discrimination, the University will determine whether the individual failed to adequately respond and what further responsive actions, if any, must be taken.  *Reporting Deadline: September 1, 2020* | Implemented | *Report timely submitted to OCR on 9/1/20.  Results of reviews were also shared with MSU Community in an email sent by President Stanley.* |
| **III.A.2** | The University will document any actions taken in the employee’s or former employee’s personnel file and will document any investigation or any action taken in accordance with its existing policies as revised. *Reporting Deadline: October 1, 2020* | Implemented |  |
| **III.A.3** | The University will provide OCR with documentation verifying any actions taken with respect to current or former employees.  *Reporting Deadline: October 1, 2020* | Implemented |  |

### Climate & Training

To address any impact determined to exist and provide appropriate remedies to restore access to University programs and activities.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **IV.A.1** | The University will take measures to determine the impact of the conduct of Nassar and Strampel at the College of Osteopathic Medicine (COM) and the MSU Sports Medicine Clinic on students’ and employees’ equal access to University education programs and activities. *Reporting Deadline: February 1, 2020 (climate assessments)* | Implemented | *Multiple initiatives including climate assessments were performed, by both internal units (Prevention, Outreach and Education (POE) Department) and external third parties, to identify the culture and improve climate.* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **IV.A.2** | The University will then take action to address any impact determined to exist by, for example, providing appropriate remedies as necessary to restore their access to the University’s programs and activities. *Reporting Deadline: March 1, 2020 (offering of services) and June 1, 2020 (documentation of specific services provided)* | Implemented | *Submissions timely made to OCR. The University has offered remedies and services and continues to welcome individually impacted students and employees to contact the Title IX Coordinator.* |
| **IV.B.1** | The University will assess the potential benefits and detriments of revising its anti-harassment training to include training targeted at student athletes. *Reporting Deadline: November 1, 2019* | Implemented | *The University currently offers targeted training to student-athletes through a program titled "Spartans Against Violence". The assessment determined additional content will be provided beginning the second session of the 2019/2020 academic year.* |
| **IV.B.2** | If the assessment provides, the University will revise its anti-harassment training to ensure that student athletes receive training to help them identify sexual harassment or assault that is covered by Title IX and that occurs in the context of medical treatment. *Reporting Deadline: May 3, 2020* | Implemented | *Supplemental training information was provided to 2019-2020 student-athletes and will be included in future training for student-athletes.* |
| **IV.C** | Select University officials (including the President, BOT, Title IX Office and OGC staff, and select administrators) will receive comprehensive Title IX training from OCR. *Reporting Deadline: Scheduled with OCR by September 30, 2019* | In Progress | *Reporting deadline extended (with approval from OCR). MSU and OCR are working to coordinate training consistent with new Title IX regulation. In the interim, university officials including the BOT, President, and OGC have received internal training from the RVSM Presidential Advisers.* |

### Youth Programs

To ensure that the University exercises adequate Title IX oversight over its youth programs.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **V.A.1** | The University will notify Youth Program participants of its Title IX grievance procedure and that the procedure applies to Youth Programs. *Reporting Deadline: October 15, 2019* | Implemented | *The Youth Programs policy and handbook templates were updated to incorporate this information. Leadership of entities currently sponsoring youth programs were notified of this requirement.* |
| **V.A.2** | The University will revise the Youth Programs Policy and handbook to reflect information contained in the notification (how to file a complaint, contact information for individual with whom complaints may be filed, contact information of the Title IX Coordinator, and the Title IX Coordinator and Title IX Office's role in processing complaints).  *Reporting Deadline: October 15, 2019* | Implemented | *The Youth Programs policy and handbook templates were updated to incorporate this information and revisions were submitted timely and deemed sufficient by OCR.* |

### Individual Remedies

To fully assess and remedy any sex discrimination that Nassar or Strampel caused that has denied a student the ability to participate in or benefit from the University's program, or that unreasonably interfered with an individual's work performance or opportunities.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **VI.A.1** | The University will post a notice on the home page of the University’s website inviting students, former students, employees and former employees who were subjected to sexual harassment or assault by Nassar to contact the Title IX Office. This notice will remain posted for 180 days and will inform individuals that appropriate remedies may be provided as necessary to restore their access to University programs and activities. *Reporting Deadline: September 30, 2019* | Implemented | *The link was posted on 9/27/2019 and submission was timely made to OCR. The link remained available through March 2020 (180 days). OCR indicated full implementation on 8/19/2020.* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **VI.A.2** | In response to each such report received, the Title IX Coordinator will take reasonable steps to verify the need for remedial action by communicating with the student, former student, employee or former employee, and respond in writing to each person who filed a report within 30 calendar days. *Reporting Deadline: May 30, 2020* | Implemented | *Submission was timely made to OCR. The University will continue to respond if additional requests for remedies are received.* |
| **VI.A.3** | The University will also open and/or complete all investigations of reports/complaints to OIE relating to sexual or sex-based harassment by Nassar made prior to the date of this Agreement, except where claimant previously declined a full investigation, signed a release or waiver of liability, or is engaged in ongoing litigation with the University.  *Reporting Deadline: May 30, 2020* | Implemented | *Submission was timely made to OCR.* |
| **VI.A.4** | If the University determines that Nassar engaged in sexual and/or sex-based harassment that denied a University student or employee equal access to its education programs or activities, the University will take measures to ensure that it restores the complainant's equal access to its education programs and activities. The University shall not be required to duplicate any accommodation or remedy previously provided (including support services or healing fund cash settlements) and shall not be required to provide accommodations/remedies to any person who has signed a release or waiver of liability for harms arising out of or related to Employee X's conduct.  *Reporting Deadline: May 30, 2020* | Implemented | *Submission was timely made to OCR. The University will continue to take appropriate remedial measures.* |
| **VI.B.1** | The University will complete all open Title IX investigations against Strampel and provide OCR with copies of all final investigative reports. *Reporting Deadline: August 30, 2019* | Implemented | *The final investigative report relating to open Title IX investigations against Strampel was submitted to OCR on 8/30/2019.* |
| **VI.B.2** | Any additional complaints received against Strampel will be completed promptly. | Implemented | *If additional complaints are received, they will be completed promptly.* |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Action Item** | **Task** | **MSU Status** | **Comments** |
| **VI.B.3** | If the University determines that the Dean engaged in sexual and/or gender-based harassment, the University will take measures to ensure that it restores the complainant's equal access to its education programs and activities.  *Reporting Requirement: December 14, 2019* | Implemented | *Submission was timely made to OCR. MSU will continue to respond if additional requests for remedies are received.* |

\*\* **Note**: Effective for the January 2021 update, the definitions for Implemented and Submitted status were expanded to provide additional clarity on action items that are classified as ongoing requirements. For all ongoing requirements, internal audit has either confirmed a policy/procedure was implemented or will continue to obtain evidence of required periodic submissions.